

# Particle representations for some SPDEs and measure-valued processes

- Law of large numbers
- ODEs and associated first-order PDEs
- Diffusion models and parabolic PDEs
- Systems with common randomness and SPDEs
- Limit theorems
- McKean-Vlasov equations
- Stock price set by infinitely many competing traders
- Hydrodynamic limit for symmetric simple exclusion model

with Jie Xiong



# Law of large numbers

$X$  random variable = numerical measurement in an experiment = measurable function on  $(\Omega, \mathcal{F}, P)$

*Distribution of  $X$* :  $\mu_X(\Gamma) = P\{X \in \Gamma\}$

*Expectation of  $X$* :  $E[X] = \int_{\mathbb{R}} x \mu_X(dx)$

$X_1, X_2, \dots$  independent with distribution  $\mu_X$  = measurements from repeated trials of the experiment

$$P\{X_1 \in \Gamma_1, \dots, X_m \in \Gamma_m\} = \prod_{i=1}^m \mu_X(\Gamma_i)$$

**Theorem 1** (*Law of large numbers*) If  $X_1, X_2, \dots$  are independent with distribution  $\mu_X$ , then

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{X_1 + \dots + X_n}{n} = E[X]$$

with probability one.



# Transformations of random variables

$X_1, X_2, \dots$  independent and identically distributed (iid)

Then for Borel measurable  $g$ ,  $g(X_1), g(X_2), \dots$  iid and

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{g(X_1) + \dots + g(X_n)}{n} = E[g(X)] = \int g(x) \mu_X(dx) = \langle \mu_X, g \rangle$$

almost surely.



# ODEs and associated first-order PDEs

For  $b : \mathbb{R}^d \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^d$ , consider  $\dot{X}_i = b(X_i)$  or in integrated form

$$X_i(t) = X_i(0) + \int_0^t b(X_i(s)) ds,$$

where  $X_1(0), X_2(0), \dots$  are iid. Then

$$\varphi(X_i(t)) = \varphi(X_i(0)) + \int_0^t b(X_i(s)) \cdot \nabla \varphi(X_i(s)) ds.$$

Define

$$V(t, \Gamma) = \mu_{X_i(t)}(\Gamma) = P\{X_i(t) \in \Gamma\}.$$

Then

$$\langle V(t), \varphi \rangle = \langle V(0), \varphi \rangle + \int_0^t \langle V(s), b \cdot \nabla \varphi \rangle ds,$$

so  $V$  is a weak solution of

$$v_t(t, x) = - \sum_{j=1}^d \frac{\partial}{\partial x_j} (b_j(x) v(t, x))$$



## Mapping from $E^\infty$ to $\mathcal{P}(E)$

$E$  a Polish space

$\gamma : x = (x_1, x_2, \dots) \in E^\infty \rightarrow \mu \in \mathcal{P}(E)$  if

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^n g(x_i) = \int_E g(x) \mu(dx), \quad g \in C_b(E)$$

otherwise  $\gamma(x) = \mu_0$

e.g.  $V(t) = \gamma(\{X_i(t)\})$  a.s.

$\{X_i\}$  is a representation of  $V$



# Brownian motion

Central limit theorem:  $\xi_1, \xi_2, \dots$  independent, identically distributed with  $E[\xi_i] = 0$  and  $Var(\xi_i) = 1$ . Then

$$P\left\{\frac{1}{\sqrt{n}} \sum_{i=1}^n \xi_i \leq z\right\} \rightarrow \int_{-\infty}^z \frac{1}{\sqrt{2\pi}} e^{-\frac{x^2}{2}} dx$$

Functional version:

$$W_n(t) \equiv \frac{1}{\sqrt{n}} \sum_{i=1}^{[nt]} \xi_i \text{ then } W_n \Rightarrow W$$



# Properties

$W$  has *independent increments*, that is, for  $0 = t_0 < t_1 < \dots < t_k$

$$W(t_i) - W(t_{i-1}), \quad i = 1, \dots, k$$

are independent

$$[W]_t \equiv \lim_{\max t_i - t_{i-1} \rightarrow 0} \sum (W(t_i) - W(t_{i-1}))^2 = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^{[nt]} \xi_i^2 = t$$



# Stochastic integration

If  $Y(t)$  is independent of  $\{W(t+s) - W(t) : s \geq 0\}$ ,  $t \geq 0$ , then

$$Z(t) = \int_0^t Y(s)dW(s) = \lim \sum Y(t_i)(W(t_{i+1}) - W(t_i))$$

and (typically)

$$E[Z(t)] = 0 \quad \text{and} \quad [Z]_t = \int_0^t Y^2(s)ds$$

$$\text{Var}(Z(t)) = E[Z^2(t)] = E[[Z]_t] = \int_0^t E[Y^2(s)]ds$$

We also have

$$\int_0^t U(s)dZ(s) = \int_0^t U(s)Y(s)dW(s)$$





# Diffusion models and parabolic PDEs

$$X_i(t) = X_i(0) + \int_0^t b(X_i(s))ds + \int_0^t \sigma(X_i(s))dW_i(s)$$

Think

$$X_i(t + \Delta t) \approx X_i(t) + b(X_i(t))\Delta t + \sigma(X_i(t))(W_i(t + \Delta t) - W_i(t))$$

Then

$$\begin{aligned} \varphi(X_i(t)) &= \varphi(X_i(0)) + \int_0^t b(X_i(s))\varphi'(X_i(s))ds + \int_0^t \frac{1}{2}\sigma^2(X_i(s))\varphi''(X_i(s))ds \\ &\quad + \int_0^t \sigma(X_i(s))\varphi'(X_i(s))dW_i(s) \end{aligned}$$

$$L\varphi(x) = \frac{1}{2}\sigma^2(x)\varphi''(x) + b(x)\varphi'(x) \quad \langle V(t), \varphi \rangle = \int \varphi(x)V(t, dx)$$

$$\langle V(t), \varphi \rangle = \langle V(0), \varphi \rangle + \int_0^t \langle V(s), L\varphi \rangle ds$$



# Weak solution of PDE

$V$  is a weak solution of

$$v_t = L^*v = \frac{1}{2} \frac{\partial^2}{\partial x^2} (\sigma^2(x)v(t, x)) - \sum_{j=1}^d \frac{\partial}{\partial x_j} (b_j(x)v(t, x))$$



# Gaussian white noise integral

$\nu$  a Borel measure on  $(U, r_U)$

$M(A \times [0, t])$  normal with  $E[M(A \times [0, t])] = 0$  and  $Var(M(A \times [0, t])) = \nu(A)t$  and

$$E[M(A \times [0, t])M(B \times [0, s])] = \nu(A \cap B)t \wedge s$$

Then  $M(\cup A_i \times [0, t]) = \sum M(A_i \times [0, t])$

$$Z(t) = \int_{U \times [0, t]} Y(u, s) M(du \times ds)$$

satisfies

$$E[Z(t)] = 0 \quad [Z]_t = \int_0^t \int_U Y^2(u, s) \nu(du) ds$$

$$E[Z^2(t)] = E[[Z]_t] = \int_0^t \int_U E[Y^2(u, s)] \nu(du) ds$$



# Systems with common randomness and SPDEs

$$\begin{aligned}X_i(t) &= X_i(0) + \int_0^t b(X_i(s))ds + \int_0^t \sigma(X_i(s))dW_i(s) \\ &\quad + \int_{U \times [0,t]} \alpha(X_i(s), u)M(du \times ds) \\ \varphi(X_i(t)) &= \varphi(X_i(0)) + \int_0^t b(X_i(s))\varphi'(X_i(s))ds \\ &\quad + \int_0^t \frac{1}{2}a(X_i(s))\varphi''(X_i(s))ds \\ &\quad + \int_0^t \sigma(X_i(s))\varphi'(X_i(s))dW_i(s) \\ &\quad + \int_{U \times [0,t]} \alpha(X_i(s), u)\varphi'(X_i(s))M(du \times ds)\end{aligned}$$

where  $a(x) = \sigma^2(x) + \int_U \alpha^2(x, u)\nu(du)$ .



## de Finetti's theorem

$X_1, X_2, \dots$  is *exchangeable* if

$$P\{X_1 \in \Gamma_1, \dots, X_m \in \Gamma_m\} = P\{X_{s_1} \in \Gamma_1, \dots, X_{s_m} \in \Gamma_m\}$$

$(s_1, \dots, s_m)$  any permutation of  $(1, \dots, m)$ .

**Theorem 2** (*de Finetti*) Let  $X_1, X_2, \dots$  be exchangeable. Then there exists a random probability measure  $\mu$  such that for every bounded, measurable  $g$ ,

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{g(X_1) + \dots + g(X_n)}{n} = \int g(x) \mu(dx)$$

*almost surely.*



## The SPDE

$$L\varphi(x) = \frac{1}{2}a(x)\varphi''(x) + b(x)\varphi'(x) \quad \langle V(t), \varphi \rangle = \int \varphi(x)V(t, dx)$$

$$\langle V(t), \varphi \rangle = \langle V(0), \varphi \rangle + \int_0^t \langle V(s), L\varphi \rangle ds + \int_{U \times [0, t]} \langle V(s), \alpha(\cdot, u)\varphi' \rangle M(du \times ds)$$

$V$  is a weak solution of

$$dv(x, t) = L^*v(x, t)dt - \int_U \partial_x(\alpha(x, u)v(x, t))M(du \times dt)$$



# Nonlinear system

$$X_i(t) = X_i(0) + \int_0^t b(X_i(s), V(s))ds + \int_0^t \sigma(X_i(s), V(s))dW_i(s) \\ + \int_{U \times [0, t]} \alpha(X_i(s), V(s), u)M(du \times ds)$$

$$V(t, \Gamma) = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^n \mathbf{1}_{\Gamma}(X_i(t))$$

that is,

$$V(t) = \gamma(\{X_i(t)\})$$

should exist by exchangeability.



# SPDE

$$a(x, v) = \sigma^2(x, v) + \int_U \alpha^2(x, v, u) \nu(du).$$

$$L(v)\varphi(x) = \frac{1}{2}a(x, v)\varphi''(x) + b(x, v)\varphi'(x) \quad \langle V(t), \varphi \rangle = \int \varphi(x)V(t, dx)$$

$$\begin{aligned} \langle V(t), \varphi \rangle &= \langle V(0), \varphi \rangle + \int_0^t \langle V(s), L(V(s))\varphi \rangle ds \\ &\quad + \int_{U \times [0, t]} \langle V(s), \alpha(\cdot, V(s), u)\varphi' \rangle M(du \times ds) \end{aligned}$$





# Uniqueness

Let  $\rho_W$  be the Wasserstein metric on  $\mathcal{P}(\mathbb{R}^d)$ , that is,

$$\rho_W(\mu, \nu) = \sup_{f \in B_1} \left| \int f d\mu - \int f d\nu \right|$$

$$B_1 = \{f : |f(x)| \leq 1, |f(x) - f(y)| \leq |x - y|, x, y \in \mathbb{R}^d\}$$

**Theorem 3** *Suppose*

$$\begin{aligned} & |\sigma(x, v) - \sigma(x', v')| + |b(x, v) - b(x', v')| \\ & + \sqrt{\int_{\mathbb{R}^d} |\alpha(x, v, u) - \alpha(x', v', u)|^2 \nu(du)} \\ & \leq K(|x - x'| + \rho_W(v, v')). \end{aligned}$$

*Then there exists a unique solution of the system.*



## Uniqueness for the SPDE

$$P\{X_1(t) \in \Gamma | \mathcal{F}_t^V\} = P\{X_1(t) \in \Gamma | \mathcal{F}_t^M\} = V(t, \Gamma)$$

Uniqueness for the system implies uniqueness for the SPDE.



## Convergence lemma for processes

**Lemma 4** *Let  $X^n = (X_1^n, \dots, X_{N_n}^n)$  be exchangeable families of  $D_E[0, \infty)$ -valued random variables such that  $N_n \Rightarrow \infty$  and  $X^n \Rightarrow X$  in  $D_E[0, \infty)^\infty$ .*

*Define*

$$\Xi_n = \frac{1}{N_n} \sum_{i=1}^{N_n} \delta_{X_i^n} \in \mathcal{P}(D_E[0, \infty))$$

$$\Xi = \lim_{m \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{m} \sum_{i=1}^m \delta_{X_i}$$

$$V_n(t) = \frac{1}{N_n} \sum_{i=1}^{N_n} \delta_{X_i^n(t)} \in \mathcal{P}(E)$$

$$V(t) = \lim_{m \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{m} \sum_{i=1}^m \delta_{X_i(t)}$$

*Then*

a) *For  $t_1, \dots, t_l \notin \{t : E[\Xi\{x : x(t) \neq x(t-)\}] > 0\}$*

$$(\Xi_n, V_n(t_1), \dots, V_n(t_l)) \Rightarrow (\Xi, V(t_1), \dots, V(t_l)).$$

b) *If  $X^n \Rightarrow X$  in  $D_{E^\infty}[0, \infty)$ , then  $V_n \Rightarrow V$  in  $D_{\mathcal{P}(E)}[0, \infty)$ .*



## Classical McKean-Vlasov limit For $i = 1, \dots, n$

$$X_i^n(t) = X_i^n(0) + \int_0^t \sigma(X_i^n(s), V^n(s)) dW_i(s) + \int_0^t b(X_i^n(s), V^n(s)) ds$$

where  $V^n(t) = \frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^n \delta_{X_i^n(t)}$

**Example:** 
$$X_i^n(t) = X_i^n(0) + W_i(t) + \frac{1}{n} \sum_{j=1}^n \int_0^t b(X_i^n(s) - X_j^n(s)) ds$$

Under the Lipschitz conditions,  $V^n \Rightarrow V$  satisfying

$$\langle V(t), \varphi \rangle = \langle V(0), \varphi \rangle + \int_0^t \langle V(s), L(V(s))\varphi \rangle ds$$

$$L(v)\varphi(x) = \frac{1}{2} \sum a_{ij}(x, v) \frac{\partial^2}{\partial x_i \partial x_j} \varphi(x) + \sum b_i(x, v) \frac{\partial}{\partial x_i} \varphi(x)$$

$$a(x, v) = \sigma(x, v) \sigma^T(x, v)$$



# Competing traders

$N$  traders ( $N$  even) and  $N/2$  shares of stock.

Individual trader's (log) valuation:

$$X_i(t) = X_i(0) + \sigma_1 W_i(t) + \sigma_2 W(t) + \mu t + \int_0^t \nu(S(s) - X_i(s)) ds$$

$\theta_i(t)$  is 1 if the  $i$ th trader owns the stock and  $-1$  if the  $i$ th trader does not own the stock.

$$\begin{aligned}\theta_i(t) &= \theta_i(0)(-1)^{N_i(t)} \\ N_i(t) &= Y_i\left(\int_0^t \lambda\{\theta_i(s)(S(s) - X_i(s))\}^+ ds\right).\end{aligned}$$

where the  $Y_i$  are independent Poisson processes and  $a^+ = a \vee 0$ .



# Price setting by market maker

$Q_N$  number of shares owned by the market maker

$$Q_N(t) = -\frac{1}{2} \sum_{i=1}^N \theta_i(t)$$

$$S(t) = S(0) - \int_0^t \beta \frac{1}{N} Q_N(s) ds$$



## Equation for $Q_N$

Let  $V_N^+(t) = \frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=1}^N \mathbf{1}_{\{\theta_i=1\}} \delta_{X_i(t)}$  and  $V_N^-(t) = \frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=1}^N \mathbf{1}_{\{\theta_i=-1\}} \delta_{X_i(t)}$ .

$$\begin{aligned}
 \frac{1}{N} Q_N(t) &= \frac{1}{N} Q_N(0) + \frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=1}^N \int_0^t \theta_i(s) \lambda \{ \theta_i(s) (S(s) - X_i(s)) \}^+ ds \\
 &\quad + \frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=1}^N \int_0^t \theta_i(r-) d\tilde{Y}_i \left( \int_0^r \lambda \{ \theta_i(s) (S(s) - X_i(s)) \}^+ ds \right) \\
 &= \frac{1}{N} Q_N(0) + \frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=1}^N \int_0^t \theta_i(r-) d\tilde{Y}_i \left( \int_0^r \lambda \{ \theta_i(s) (S(s) - X_i(s)) \}^+ ds \right) \\
 &\quad + \int_0^t \lambda \int (S(s) - x)^+ V_N^+(s, dx) ds - \int_0^t \lambda \int (x - S(s))^+ V_N^-(s, dx) ds
 \end{aligned}$$



# Limiting model

$$Q(t) = Q(0) + \int_0^t \lambda \int (S(s) - x)^+ V^+(s, dx) ds \\ - \int_0^t \lambda \int (x - S(s))^+ V^-(s, dx) ds$$

$$S(t) = S(0) - \int_0^t \beta Q(s) ds$$

$$\int g(x) V^+(t, dx) = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^n g(X_i(t)) \mathbf{1}_{\{\theta_i(t)=1\}}$$

$$\int g(x) U(t, dx) = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^n g(X_i(t)) \theta_i(t)$$

$$U(t) = V^+(t) - V^-(t)$$





# SPDE

$$\begin{aligned}\varphi(X_i(t)) &= \varphi(X_i(0)) + \sigma_1 \int_0^t \varphi'(X_i(s)) dW_i(s) + \sigma_2 \int_0^t \varphi'(X_i(s)) dW(s) \\ &\quad + \int_0^t \frac{1}{2}(\sigma_1^2 + \sigma_2^2) \varphi''(X_i(s)) ds \\ &\quad + \int_0^t (\mu + \nu(S(s) - X_i(s))) \varphi'(X_i(s)) ds\end{aligned}$$

$$\langle V(t), \varphi \rangle = \langle V(0), \varphi \rangle + \sigma_2 \int_0^t \langle V(s), \varphi' \rangle dW(s) + \int_0^t \langle V(s), L(S(s)) \varphi \rangle ds$$



## Equation for $U$

$$\begin{aligned}\varphi(X_i(t))\theta_i(t) &= \varphi(X_i(0))\theta_i(0) + \sigma_1 \int_0^t \varphi'(X_i(s))\theta_i(s)dW_i(s) \\ &\quad + \sigma_2 \int_0^t \varphi'(X_i(s))\theta_i(s)dW(s) \\ &\quad + \int_0^t \frac{1}{2}(\sigma_1^2 + \sigma_2^2)\varphi''(X_i(s))\theta_i(s)ds \\ &\quad + \int_0^t (\mu + \nu(S(s) - X_i(s)))\varphi'(X_i(s))\theta_i(s)ds \\ &\quad - \int_0^t 2\varphi(X_i(s))\theta_i(s-)dN_i(s)\end{aligned}$$



$$\begin{aligned}
\langle U(t), \varphi \rangle &= \langle U(0), \varphi \rangle + \sigma_2 \int_0^t \langle U(s), \varphi' \rangle dW(s) \\
&\quad + \int_0^t (\langle U(s), L(S(s))\varphi \rangle + \langle V^+(s), B^+(S(s))\varphi \rangle \\
&\quad\quad\quad + \langle V^-(s), B^-(S(s))\varphi \rangle) ds
\end{aligned}$$

where

$$B^+(s)\varphi(x) = \lambda(s-x)^+\varphi(x)$$

$$B^-(s)\varphi(x) = \lambda(x-s)^+\varphi(x)$$



## A “simplified” SPDE

Let  $\lambda, \beta \rightarrow \infty$ . Then

$$X_i(t) = X_i(0) + \sigma_1 W_i(t) + \sigma_2 W(t) + \mu t + \int_0^t \nu(S(s) - X_i(s)) ds$$

$$\langle V(t), \varphi \rangle = \langle V(0), \varphi \rangle + \sigma_2 \int_0^t \langle V(s), \varphi' \rangle dW(s) + \int_0^t \langle V(s), L(S(s))\varphi \rangle ds$$

with

$$L(s)\varphi(x) = \frac{1}{2}(\sigma_1^2 + \sigma_2^2)\varphi''(x) + (\mu + \nu(S(s) - x))\varphi'(x)$$

and  $S(t)$  is the median of  $V(t)$ .



# Hydrodynamic limit for symmetric simple exclusion model

$X_i^n$  particle location on  $E_n = \frac{1}{n}\mathbb{Z} \bmod 1$  (at most one particle per location)

$X_i^n \rightarrow X_i^n + \frac{k}{n}$  at rate  $n^2\lambda(|k|)$  unless new location is already occupied (note symmetry)

## Equivalent formulation

Swap contents of  $\frac{l}{n}$  and  $\frac{k}{n}$  at rate  $n^2\lambda(|k-l|)$

$$\begin{aligned} X_i^n(t) &= X_i^n(0) + \frac{1}{n} \sum_{l \neq k} \int_0^t (l-k) \mathbf{1}_{\{X_i^n(s-) = k\}} dY_{kl}(n^2\lambda(|k-l|)s) \\ &= X_i^n(0) + \frac{1}{n} \sum_{l \neq k} \int_0^t (l-k) \mathbf{1}_{\{X_i^n(s-) = k\}} d\tilde{Y}_{kl}(n^2\lambda(|k-l|)s) \end{aligned}$$

$Y_{kl} = Y_{lk}$  independent unit Poisson processes and  $\tilde{Y}_{kl}(u) = Y_{kl}(u) - u$ .



# Convergence

$$\begin{aligned}
 [X_i^n]_t &= \frac{1}{n^2} \sum_{l \neq k} \int_0^t (l - k)^2 \mathbf{1}_{\{X_i^n(s-) = k\}} dY_{kl}(n^2 \lambda(|k - l|)s) \\
 &= \frac{1}{n^2} \sum_{l \neq k} \int_0^t (l - k)^2 \mathbf{1}_{\{X_i^n(s-) = k\}} d\tilde{Y}_{kl}(n^2 \lambda(|k - l|)s) + \sigma^2 t
 \end{aligned}$$

Then  $[X_i^n]_t \rightarrow \sigma^2 t$ ,  $\sigma^2 = \sum_k k^2 \lambda(|k|)$ , and by the martingale central limit theorem,  $X_i^n \Rightarrow X_i$  where  $X_i(t) = X_i(0) + \sigma W_i(t)$ .

$$[X_i^n, X_j^n]_t = -\frac{1}{n^2} \sum_{l \neq k} \int_0^t (l - k)^2 \mathbf{1}_{\{X_i^n(s-) = k, X_j^n(s-) = l\}} dY_{kl}(n^2 \lambda(|k - l|)s)$$

converges to zero which implies the  $W_i$  are independent.

Therefore  $V_n \Rightarrow V$ , where  $V(t, \Gamma) = \int_{\Gamma} v(t, x) dx$  and

$$v_t = \frac{1}{2} \sigma^2 \Delta v$$



## Basic convergence lemma

**Lemma 5** For  $n = 1, 2, \dots$ , let  $\{\xi_1^n, \dots, \xi_{N_n}^n\}$  be exchangeable in  $S$  (allowing)  $N_n \rightarrow \infty$ .) Let  $\Xi^n$  be the empirical measure,

$$\Xi^n = \frac{1}{N_n} \sum_{i=1}^{N_n} \delta_{\xi_i^n}.$$

Assume  $N_n \rightarrow \infty$ , and for each  $m = 1, 2, \dots$ ,  $\{\xi_1^n, \dots, \xi_m^n\} \Rightarrow \{\xi_1, \dots, \xi_m\}$  in  $S^m$ .

Then  $\{\xi_i\}$  is exchangeable and setting  $\xi_i^n = s_0 \in S$  for  $i > N_n$ ,  $\{\Xi^n, \xi_1^n, \xi_2^n, \dots\} \Rightarrow \{\Xi, \xi_1, \xi_2, \dots\}$  in  $\mathcal{P}(S) \times S^\infty$ , where  $\Xi$  is the deFinetti measure for  $\{\xi_i\}$ .

If for each  $m$ ,  $\{\xi_1^n, \dots, \xi_m^n\} \rightarrow \{\xi_1, \dots, \xi_m\}$  in probability in  $S^m$ , then  $\Xi^n \rightarrow \Xi$  in probability in  $\mathcal{P}(S)$ .



## Remarks

- a) The set  $D_{\Xi} = \{t : E[\Xi\{x : x(t) \neq x(t-)\}] > 0\}$  is at most countable.
- b) If for  $i \neq j$ , with probability one,  $X_i$  and  $X_j$  have no simultaneous discontinuities, then  $D_{\Xi} = \emptyset$  and convergence of  $X^n$  to  $X$  in  $D_E[0, \infty)^\infty$  implies convergence in  $D_{E^\infty}[0, \infty)$ .

